Working with Vaccine Hesitant Parents using the C.A.S.E. Approach

Robert M Jacobson, MD, FAAP
Professor of Pediatrics, Mayo Clinic
Medical Director, ECH Immunization Program
President, MN Chap Amer Acad of Pediatrics
Disclosures

• Potential conflicts
  – Principal Investigator
    • Adult PCV13 Prevnar® 13 vaccine (Pfizer)
    • Adolescent MCV4 Menveo® vaccine (Novartis)
  – Safety Review Committee
    • Male HPV4 Gardasil® vaccine (Merck)
  – Data and Safety Monitoring Board
    • Adult and infant PCV15 (Merck)

• No off-label use discussion
Disclosures

• Potential conflicts
  – Jacobson v Massachusetts
  – Reverend Henning Jacobson
  – Martin Bror Johan Jacobson
  – Robert Bror Jacobson
Learning Objectives

• Relate a new approach to vaccine hesitancy
• Identify each of its 4 components
• Describe how it works in 3 common scenarios
The State of Vaccination

• The anti-vaccine movement is thriving
  – Successful vaccination makes its value invisible
  – Media seeks to portray controversy, “both sides”
  – Americans culturally opposed to “social health”

• Vaccine hesitancy is a major issue
  – Not just among exempters and delayers
  – Even 25 to 30% of those up-to-date

• Both vaccine provider and parent struggle
The Vaccine Provider in the Office

• Has little time for discussion
• Suffers a sense of rejection as wise advisor
• Feels sense of futility
• Recognizes problem of health illiteracy
The Parent in the Office

- Would like to be heard
- Wishes to be respected
- Seeks credible information
- Wants control; wants to make the decision
Hey, lady! Where do you want this health care delivered?
Hey, lady! Where do you want this health care delivered?
Rhetoric
Rhetoric

Logos
Most important moment comes at the doctor's office!
Need to bring more passion to the discussion!
Rhetoric

Pathos

Logos
The C.A.S.E. for Vaccines

• A model for talking to vaccine-hesitant parents
• A mnemonic to organize a rapid, useful response
• Created by Alison Tepper Singer
  – Formerly, NBC and CNBC television producer
  – Mother of an autistic child
  – Quit Autism Speaks over its anti-vaccination stance
  – Founding CEO of Autism Science Foundation
  – Strong advocate of science and routine vaccination
The Case for C.A.S.E.

- Provides more than just information
- Has historical roots in Aristotelian rhetoric
- Lacks published studies of its efficacy
- Nonetheless has face validity
- Lacks competing alternatives
- Preserves the relationship
The C.A.S.E. Acronym

- Corroborate
- About Me
- Science
- Explain/Advise
The C.A.S.E. Approach

• **Corroborate:**
  – Acknowledge the person’s concern
  – Find some point on which you can agree
  – Set the tone for a respectful, successful talk

• **About Me:**
  – Describe what you have done to build your knowledge base and expertise

• **Science:**
  – Relate what the science says

• **Explain/Advise:**
  – Explain your advice to patient, based on the science
A Hesitant Teen

I don't like needles
-- they hurt too much
I agree that they hurt. I wish I could give you this protection without a needle.
But I've studied this situation, read the studies, listened to the experts, weighed the evidence.
C.A.S.E. in Action

The vaccine prevents a common form of cancer that ruins young adult lives. The pain is only temporary.
That’s why I’m advising you to get this vaccine. That’s why I’ve had my own teens get it! The benefit’s worth the pain.
C for Corroborate

I agree that they hurt. I wish I could give you this protection without a needle.
Other Forms of Corroboration

• I used to think the same thing too
• You’re not the first parent who’s asked me that
• I think we agree on the principles
But I've studied this situation, read the studies, listened to the experts, weighed the evidence.
Other Forms of About Me

• This is one of the most important things I do
• I’ve been studying this topic for years
• I’ve dedicated my life to this work
• I lose money on vaccines but I don’t regret it
The vaccine prevents a common form of cancer that ruins young adult lives. The pain is only temporary.
Other Forms of Science

• Let me tell you a story about a patient of mine...
• No vaccine is 100% safe but studies show...
• I asked a leading expert the same question...
That’s why I’m advising you to get this vaccine. That’s why I’ve had my own teens get it! The benefit’s worth the pain.
Other Forms of Explain/Advise

• That’s why I got the vaccine myself
• If I had children, I’d get them this vaccine
• If I were in your shoes, I’d choose to vaccinate
• I feel more strongly about this than I do about antibiotics for ear infections
Corroborate

Persuasion

Passion

Standing

Information
Persuasion

Corroborate

Passion

Standing

About Me

Information
C.A.S.E.

- Not just education
- Not just information
- Not just the fact
- But your advice

- You have more than science
- You have your standing with the parent
- You have the passion you hold for your advice
A Hesitant Parent

My baby hates car seats, they cost too much, and it just profits the big businesses that make them. Just tell me the best way to hold my child.
You and I both want your baby to be safe, and I don’t want you to waste your money.
About Me

But I’ve studied this as protecting babies from car accidents is part of my job.
Science

The car seats are worth it. They really work. They decrease your baby’s chance of dying in a car accident by 50%.
Telling you anything less than to buy and use a car seat for your baby would be substandard care.
Three Scenarios

- HPV
- Influenza
- Meningococcal vaccine
The Parent and the HPV Vaccine

We won’t be doing *that* vaccine today. We’re fine with the others.
Please tell me why you feel that way. Help me understand your thinking.
My son's not sexually active and so he doesn't need a vaccine like this now.
Corroborate

I'm glad he's not sexually active, and I can understand why you are wondering why I want to give him the vaccine so early in his life.
I've read the recommendations and looked at the studies for why the vaccine needs to be given now for later in life.
The vaccine only prevents HPV infection. It doesn’t treat it. It’s designed to be long-lasting, and children at your son’s age respond better than older teens.
Explain/Advise

It takes 3 shots over at least six months to get full protection. That protection lasts for years and years. If we wait until he’s sexually active, it’ll be too late.
The Parent and the Flu Vaccine

She’s never had the flu vaccine before and she’s been fine. We’ll just pass.
I can imagine why you feel that way. It’s true that we rarely diagnose the flu in outpatient visits with people your daughter’s age.
About Me

In fact, I used to think the same way as you do. But as I have read about the new recommendations and the basis for them, I’ve changed my mind.
Teens have a 40% chance of getting the flu each year. It can present as a fever and sore throat—just like strep—only the strep test’s negative. We don’t test for flu in the office because of the cost.
Given how common the flu is—despite the fact we don’t spend the money to diagnose it—I recommend the flu vaccine to prevent those illnesses and visits.
The Parent and the MCV

Vaccines are just not natural, and we've decided to rely just on natural immunity.
I like the idea of natural things too. And you and I both want what will keep your son healthy and free of injury.
About Me

As part of my continuing education, I’ve listened to lectures and read papers about the meningococcal vaccine and the infections they prevent.
Science

Natural immunity fails to protect. While 5 to 30% of us just carry the germ in our noses, we expose others. A very small number get very ill. About 10% die despite appropriate care. 20% have permanent injuries.
The disease is unpredictable and devastating. It comes at the prime of life and in hours destroys it. That’s why I recommend your teen to get this disease.
The C.A.S.E. Approach

• Corroborate:
  – Connect **emotionally** with the parent.

– About Me:
  – **Buttress** your professional standing with the parent

• Science:
  – **Summarize** the science

• Explain/Advise:
  – **Passionately** advise given your status or standing and the science
Practice

• Pair up in twos
• Have one play the role of a hesitating parent
• Have one play the role of vaccine provider
• Work through all four steps of C.A.S.E.
  – Corroborate
  – About Me
  – Science
  – Explain/Advise
• Switch roles
Summary

- Relate a new approach to vaccine hesitancy
  - Passionately advise using science and standing
- Identify each of the 4 components of C.A.S.E.
  - Corroborate
  - About Me
  - Science
  - Explain/Advise
- Describe how it works in 3 common scenarios